

Reflections on the Disorienting Dilemmas Project

Deadline for submission is November 17, 2021 EOD. One submission per team please.

EPP name: Mount Saint Mary's University

Participants from the EPP: Julie Feldman-Abe, Judy Chiasson,

Participants from the District Partner(s): Berenice Villa, Cindy Del Rio

1. Reflect on the process of developing the vignettes.

Our team met a few times and brainstormed possible ideas for vignettes. We had a large number of possibilities coming from the private school partners, the public schools and higher education. We categorized the anecdotes and selected the ones we felt were representative of different types of challenges, and that were likely that teachers might encounter. The collaboration was very productive. As we moved along, we discussed various “exemplary responses” and came up with a model for how candidates could analyze vignettes in the future. The team worked well together creating the vignettes and refining the protocol.

We next piloted 8 vignettes with 3 alumni who gave us feedback on the process. We realized that the assessment took too long and that we'd prefer to rank the confidence questions. Confidence, we discussed, is not enough of a measure, as it must be considered along with competence at answering the scenarios. In the end, we decided to have candidates rank the scenarios by level of confidence and then only write to two of the scenarios – one that they felt most confident in and one in which they felt least confident.

We piloted the assessment with the full-time faculty at a meeting and they had a lively discussion about one of the vignettes regarding colorism. The faculty interpreted the question differently than our group intended, which was interesting to note. We gathered feedback for improving the tool and added further revisions.

2. Describe how you implemented the vignettes.

The assessment was next piloted in the Introduction to Elementary Methods course. The students did the full assessment before class, and then the instructor selected one vignette to debrief together in class. The class worked in small groups to discuss the vignette and the instructor provided notes on how the implementation went. The assessment will be piloted with the secondary students in a similar manner and the same vignette will be debriefed in class.

The next step is to pilot an instructional discussion using a different vignette with the same students who are enrolled in the Diversity and Schools class. We intend on modeling how to

analyze and think through possible responses to the gender identity/ gender expression vignette.

The goal is to both teach the content and provide students with the tools to consider different lenses as they brainstorm effective responses: legal, professional, student's social-emotional well-being, possible community response and need for further resources/consultation. The goal is to provide students with an approach which they can apply as they encounter new scenarios in the field.

3. Share any lessons learned from implementing the vignettes.

It was interesting to see that the intended issues in the colorism vignette were interpreted differently by the faculty. This demonstrates that there are multiple interpretations based on the experience the audience brings to the scenario. Because the vignettes are short, there were many clarifying questions that might alter a teacher's response.

When modeling the case study approach in the Diversity class, we will present the vignette, then provide an opportunity for clarifying questions to fill in some more details that might influence their responses. Then we will ask students to work together to make recommendations for actions. Then we will provide a handout with the various analytical lens questions for them to reconsider their original responses. We will let you know how this goes!

4. What are some next steps?

- 1) Implement assessment with secondary students and analyze student responses. Find out which vignettes seem to inspire most/ least confidence. From what we saw with the elementary candidates, there is definitely a need for instruction around how to analyze these scenarios and respond appropriately.
- 2) Pilot the instructional conversation in Diversity class on how to approach these types of scenarios.
- 3) Discuss as a faculty how we want to further implement this assessment throughout our program. We may integrate different vignettes in different courses, or potentially develop a course that centers around researching the issues that are exemplified in the vignettes.